Security Rating Template

Hoferichter & Jentsch (2024)

Rating	Criteria for Rating		Initial Score		Adjust		Final Score
	Design	**Attrition**					
5🔒	Randomised design	0-10%					
4🔒	Design for comparison that considers some type of selection on unobservable characteristics (e.g. RDD, Diff-in-Diffs, Matched Diff-in-Diffs)	11-20%			Adjustment for threats to internal validity **[-2]**		
3🔒	Design for comparison that considers selection on all relevant observable confounders (e.g. Matching or Regression Analysis with variables descriptive of the selection mechanism)	21-30%					
2🔒	Design for comparison that considers selection only on some relevant confounders	31-40%					
1🔒	Design for comparison that does not consider selection on any relevant confounders	41-50%					
0🔒	No comparator	>50%	**0**				**0**

Threats to Validity	Threat to Internal Validity?	Comments
Threat 1: Confounding	Moderate	Some characteristics at baseline are considered.
Threat 2: Concurrent Interventions	High	No information provided.
Threat 3: Experimental effects	High	Self-selection into the experimental group suggests possibility of different motivation n to engage with the theme of the intervention.
Threat 4: Implementation fidelity	Moderate	Intervention is reasonably well described and typical practice at tertiary education suggest fidelity. No information about control group.

Threat 5: Missing Data	High	Missingness is high and incompletely reported.
Threat 6: Measurement	Moderate	Established tool are used and consistency has been calculated and found to be acceptable. No blinding.
Threat 7: Selective reporting	High	No protocol/registration information and no way to check if planned analyses were the same as those ultimately carried out.

- **Initial padlock score:** 0 Padlocks – This used a design that cannot be said to have ensured comparability between groups and attrition was very high.
- **Reason for adjustment for threats to validity**: -2 Padlocks – Four threats to internal validity are classified as high.
- **Final padlock score:** initial score adjusted for threats to validity = 0 Padlocks. The study was already at the lowest rating possible after initial score had been determined. As a negative rating cannot be assigned, it stays at 0 Padlocks.